

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abbreviations	xi
Chapter 1 – ESC rights before courts: Introduction	1
The purpose of this report	2
The structure of the report	5
What is ‘justiciability’? The right to a remedy for a violation	6
What is an independent and impartial body?	8
ESC rights compared to civil and political rights	9
Positive and negative obligations	10
Chapter 2 – Defining the content of ESC rights I: ESC rights as a basis for adjudication	13
The development of ESC rights – an historical perspective	13
Labour law as a substitute for ESC rights?	13
Critiques of ESC rights on account of their ‘vagueness’	15
Statutory definitions of ESC rights	16
The role of international treaty bodies and international experts in defining the content of ESC rights	17
Implementing international standards domestically to explain the content of ESC rights	18
‘Monist’ systems	19
‘Dualist’ systems	19
Defining the language of human rights in the context of constitutional provisions – an overview	19
The prohibition on arbitrariness as a means of giving content to the obligations arising from ESC rights	21

Chapter 3 – Defining the content of ESC rights II: Developments in domestic and international courts and tribunals

Core content or minimum core duties	23
Duties of immediate effect and duties linked with the progressive realization of ESC rights	25
Duties of immediate effect	26
The right to housing and duties of immediate effect	27
The right to work and duties of immediate effect	27
Duties related to the progressive realization of ESC rights	28
The prohibition of retrogressive measures	29
'Reasonableness', 'adequateness' and 'proportionality' as judicial standards	33
Judicial review of goals and means	34
<i>Grootboom</i> : the right to adequate housing	38
Treatment Action Campaign (TAC): the right to health	39
Justiciability and State omissions	40
Duties to respect, protect and fulfil	42
Duties to respect	42
The duty to respect ESC rights: case law examples	43
<i>SERAC and CESR v. Nigeria</i>	44
Duties to protect	45
The duty to protect ESC rights: case law examples	46
<i>Etcheverry v. Omint</i>	48
Duties to fulfil	48
The duty to fulfil ESC rights: case law examples	49
<i>Soobramoney</i>	52

Non-discrimination and equal protection of the law	54
‘Suspect categories’	54
Non-discrimination and equal protection of the law: case law examples	55
Discrimination in the field of housing and social security benefits	55
Discrimination and the right to work	56
Discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation and ESC rights	57
Inequality in the provision of services: new interpretations	57
Affirmative, positive or ‘special’ measures	59
Procedural guarantees built into ESC rights	61
Fair trial rights and ESC rights	61
Summary: different ways in which courts have given meaning to the content of ESC rights	64
 Chapter 4 – Defining the content of ESC rights III: The indivisibility of human rights in practice: indirect protection of ESC rights through civil and political rights	 65
The right to health and civil and political rights protection	65
The right to housing and civil and political rights protection	66
The right to education and civil and political rights protection	68
The right to social security and civil and political rights protection	69
Trade union rights and the right to work and civil and political rights protection	69
The relationship between basic welfare services and civil and political rights	71
 Chapter 5 – The proper role of courts in determining how social policies comply with legal norms	 73
The ‘Separation of Powers’ Argument	73
The ‘legal’ and the ‘political’ in rights-based jurisdictions	74

'Political questions'	75
The definition of the role of the judiciary	75
Superior and inferior law: the hierarchical structure of legal systems	76
The judge's role in the implementation of ESC rights	77
Different situations for adjudication in the field of ESC rights	77
Application of and compliance with statutory provisions	77
Are courts equipped to enforce non-compliance with positive duties to guarantee ESC rights?	80
Partial omission or irregular compliance	81
'Checks and balances'	82
Budget allocations and the degree of detail in judicial remedies	83
Degrees and details in judicial remedies	84
Judicial deference and the implementation of ESC rights	85
Chapter 6 – Procedural challenges and solutions	89
The alleged professional incapacity of judges to confront and solve conflicts regarding social, economic and cultural issues	90
The alleged institutional incapacity of the judiciary to enforce ESC rights decisions on the political branches of the State	91
Procedural limitations and the inadequacy of some traditional procedural mechanisms for protecting social rights	92
The limits of traditional procedural mechanisms	92
Administrative discretion	93
The inadequacies of court procedure mechanisms to deal with complex issues in the area of ESC rights	93
Procedural reform and the lessons from the development of comparative law	95
The standing of the State before domestic courts	97

Chapter 7 – Justiciability of ESC rights in the domestic sphere and international human rights law 99

Justiciability in the domestic sphere and international human rights law: some appraisals	99
Developments in international human rights and justiciability in the domestic sphere	101
The value of international human rights law for ESC rights	101
Creating an enforcement mechanism for the ICESCR	102
Summary conclusions: strategies for strengthening justiciability of ESC rights	103
Table of cases	107
Domestic courts	107
International Courts and Treaty Bodies	116